

Review Manuscript Number: angeo-2019-97

Title: "Historical Aurora Borealis Observations in Anatolia during **the** medieval period (AD 1-1453): Implications for the past solar activity"

Author: Nafiz Maden

General Comments:

In this paper, the author reports an overview of historical Aurora observations reports in Anatolia and Middle East regions in the medieval period based in historical texts, chronicles and aurora catalogs records. The paper presented a relationship between the auroral activity and the past solar activity, the past climatic changes, economy and society living in the remote time.

My view on the paper is that the discussions are interesting, and more discussions and clarifications were made in the revised version and the full paper desire publication in the ANGEO.

Major Comments:

All the major comments in the previous version was answered in a proper way, and at this point I do not have any major recommendation.

Minor issues:

Line 1 (pg 1): In the title would not more correct to add the word "the" before "medieval period"? and also one space after "AD ..."?

Line 73 (pg 4): In the title of the section 2, I think that the word "Catalog" for the hAAc acronyms should be with "c" instead of "C".

Line 231 (pg 10): I suggest changing the sentence "23 different historical aurora records..." for "Twenty-three different aurora records...".

Line 357: In the Conclusions section, add the words "the" and "field" just after in the following sentence (check the correct language in this case): "... important information on variations in **the** geomagnetic **field** and auroral activity..."

The last suggestion is to enumerate the pages in the button right side or according to the journal standard.

Sincerely yours,

Dr. José Valentin Bageston

Reviewer # 1