

Comments for the manuscript: “Earth’s radiation belts ions: Patterns of the spatial-energy structure and its solar-cyclic variations” by A. S. Kovtyukh

I think that the manuscript now is much linear and easy to read. I have just a few more corrections though, mostly concerning the fluency of the text and no more technical questions. The list is reported below.

Line	Comment
12	“[...] in the inner regions of the ERB, fluxes [...]”
24-25	“The ERB consist mainly of electrons and protons, but there are also helium nuclei and other [...]”
33	“[...] geomagnetic trap, drift conserving [...] and populate [...]”
34-35	“This layer is called the drift shell.”
37	“For the dipole magnetic field, L is [...]”
42	“[...] along a certain magnetic field line [...]”
43-44	“This dependence is described [...]”
45	“[...] the same magnetic field line, respectively [...]”
48-49	“[...] of radial diffusion of ions towards [...]”
53	“The inner belt ($L < 2.5$) of protons with $E > 10$ MeV is formed by [...]”
55	“For protons with $E < 10$ MeV, this mechanism [...]”
56	“The inner belt of ions with $Z > 4$ is formed [...]”
58-59	“In the intermediate region ($2.5 < L < 3.5$), the mechanism of a ion capture from the Solar Cosmic Rays takes place during strong magnetic storms [...]”
62	“However, for a comprehensive verification [...]”
76-77	“[...] the possibility to create sufficiently complete and reliable empirical models [...]”
79-83	“In the following sections, the spatial-energy structure of the ERB in the $\{E, L\}$ space for protons, helium and CNO group ions are considered (Sect. 2), together with possible physical mechanisms of formation of these structures and their solar-cyclic variations (Sect. 3). Finally, the main conclusions of this work are given (Sect. 4).”
89	“According to this criterion and to the theory of [...]”
91	“[...] represents this very boundary [...]”
93-94	“A significant number of these discrepancies can be connected to the [...]”
107-108	“[...] to separate fluxes of ions by their charge. Moreover, for the ions [...]”
114-115	“[...] the results of every experiment can be compared to the others [...]”
119	“Figures 1–6 show the spatial-energy distributions [...]”

120 I suggest removing entirely the quote “hese figures united in pairs: ” and just leave the part
describing odd and even Figures

123-124 “The markers are connected by lines of equal intensity [...] ”

132 I suggest removing the quote “In this place, it is need to say a few words about the method
of constructing these figures.[...] ”

147 “[...] corresponding set of experimental points (icons); then it was transferred [...] ”

185 “Figure N sums up results from [...] ”

188-189 “21st / 22nd / 23rd [...] ”

190 See line 185

198 See lines 188-189

205 “From a comparison of Figs. 1 and 2, one can see [...] ”

210 “[...] (2016a,b), which have been constructed from Figs. 1 and 2 confirm [...] ”

214 “[...] $J \propto E^{-\gamma}$, where the index $\gamma = [...]$ ”

219 I would remove the “of the magnetic field” part here, magnetic field lines already describe
everything

223 “Segments of iso-lines, that are parallel to the red line, also correspond to [...] ”

227 “at $L = 3-6$, $\gamma = 4.8 \pm 0.5$. [...] ”

228 “between these iso-lines increase with L [...] ”

239 “[...] helium ion fluxes, averaged for quiet periods ($K_p < 2$), are presented [...] ”

240 See line 185

244-245 See lines 188-189

246 See line 185

250 See lines 188-189

251 “with Figs. 3–4, one can see that [...] ”

253-254 “[...] $E > 1$ MeV practically do not change, and [...] ”

255 “Figures 3 and 4 show the same patterns [...] ”

258 “[...] because there are no experimental data for helium ions in these regions. [...] ”

266 “For helium spectra [...] ”

270 “[...] the red line (i.e. in the region of power-law spectra) substantially deviate from [...] ”

278 “[...] CNO group ions fluxes, averaged for quiet periods ($K_p < 2$), are [...] ”

280 See line 185

283-284 See lines 188-189

285 See line 185

286-287 “[...] period of activity [...] ”

289 “[...] nd its configuration differ [...] ”

291 “[...] Figs. 5–6 one can see that, for ions of CNO group, the [...] ”

297 “[...] This means that, for ions of the CNO group, the ionization [...] ”

300 “[...] have not been obtained by the experiments collected in [...] ”

304 “[...] especially large at the peak of solar activity (Fig. 6): during these times, the slope of
iso-lines [...] ”

306 “At the same time, at $L > 4$ in Fig. 5 and at $L > 3$ in Fig. 6, the iso-lines [...] ”

316 “[...] at the minimum of solar activity [...] ”

319 “[...] following the results obtained [...] ”

324 “[...] and are reduced rapidly with [...] ”
328 “[...] have not been considered in these works [...] ”
329 “In quiet periods, only the mechanism of ionization loss is significant [...] ”
330 “[...] trapped in small L [...] ”
331 “[...] the ERB protons are determined, in this mechanism, by the density [...] ”
336 “[...] the proton supply rates to the inner belt, under the action of the CRAND mechanism, remain [...] ”
338 “[...] with decreasing solar activity [...] ”
341 “A proton lifetime on [...] ”
352 “[...] this was noted in sections [...] ”
357 “[...] where L^* corresponds to the L shell of protons of the same energy [...] ”
362 “[...] remains unchanged [...] ”
363-364 “[...] in fact, these protons form mainly under the action [...] ”
369 “[...] of radial diffuson of ions during the [...] ”
377 “[...] values of L, these fluxes begin [...] ”
384 “[...] highly turbulized region, but [...] ”
387 “[...] must be generated in the outer [...] ”
389 “The high-energy part of the ion [...] ”
390 “[...] has a power-law shape and the exponents [...] ”
394-395 “[...] along logarithmic axes E and J in a J(E) plane [...] ”
424 “[...] decreases rapidly with [...] ”
426 “Then, the lower boundary [...] ”
429 “Using B_s [...] ”
434-435 “[...] as a result of their interactions with the current layer [...] ”
439 “It has been found that in the outer belt [...] ”
438-439 “[...] in the near equatorial plane [...] ”
443 “[...] radial diffusion which conserves μ [...] ”
448 “This kind of dependence of the amplitude [...] ”
461 “[...] the extensive gaps in $Z \geq 2$ ion data do not allow [...] ”
640-644 For what concerns all the Figures, the captions are very similar, so I suggest a modification in the first one (Figure 1) that should be repeated for all the others: “[...] J, which is given in units of $(\text{cm}^2 \text{ s ster MeV})^{-1}$, is the differential flux of protons [...] ”. Also “associated with” and “[...] the power-law tail of the proton spectra, while green line corresponds to [...] ”
